

MODULATION AND TRANSLATION ACCURACY OF *THE LEGEND OF KORRA* SEASON 4 SUBTITLE

Akhmad Multazim¹, Sintarti², Atikasari Husna³

Department of English Education, Universitas Ahmad Dahlan
jaymultazim@gmail.com ¹, [yantokusinta@gmail.com](mailto:yantosusinta@gmail.com) ²,
atikasari.husna@gmail.com³

ABSTRACT

This research aims to find out the types of modulation procedure in the subtitle of *the legend of Korra season 4* and describe the accuracy of the subtitle of the movie. The data are subtitles containing modulation procedure taken from English and Indonesian subtitle of *the legend of Korra season 4* and its accuracy assessment. To collect the data, the subtitle was transcribed and questionnaires were distributed to raters to assess translation accuracy. It used Vinay dan Darbelnet's theory of modulation procedure and Nababan's theory of translation accuracy assessment. The result of the research shows that there are 8 out of 10 types of modulation procedure; Abstract for Concrete (10 data), The Part for The Whole (6 data), One Part for Another (5 data), Reversal of Terms (14 data), Negation of Opposite (5 data), Active to Passive (29 data), Space For Time (4 data) and Exchange of Intervals For Limits (5 data). Active to Passive was the most dominant type used in the subtitle. Out of 78 data, 49 data (62,82%) are accurately transferred. It can be concluded that the subtitle of the legend of Korra season 4 is accurate.

Keywords: *Subtitling, Modulation, Translation Accuracy, Korra*

INTRODUCTION

The use of multi languages makes translation studies becomes very important in this era since the issue of globalization and the development of technology continuously develop. It makes the publishing and translation market wider. One of translation types is Audio-Visual Translation (AVT) that we can find in film, recorded speech or recorded international TV program. Mostly, audio-visual translation comes in two ways; subtitling and dubbing.

According to Lever (1989) subtitles can be defined as transcriptions of film or TV dialogue, presented simultaneously on the screen. He adds that the types of subtitling can be divided into two categories: intralingual and interlingual subtitling. Intralingual subtitling deals with production of subtitle in the same

language. On the other hands, interlingual subtitling deals with production of subtitle in different languages (TL).

In producing subtitling, there are several types of translation procedure that the subtitler can use to translate from SL into TL. Vinay and Darbelnet (2000) propose seven procedures of translation. They are borrowing, calque, literal translation, transposition, modulation, equivalence and adaptation.

One of translation procedures is modulation procedure. This procedure deals with the changes through the change of point of view or perspective of the translator. Sometimes, a text can be translated literally and it is grammatically correct. However, it still sounds weird or is not acceptable in TL.

This research focuses on the types of modulation as one of translation procedures and accuracy assessment as one of aspects in translation quality assessment. The use of translation procedure strongly influences the quality of translation product. The use of inappropriate translation procedure may decrease the quality of translation. The types of modulation are analyzed to assess the translation accuracy.

Translation Quality Assessment (TQA) is used to assess or measure degree of translation quality. It is very important to know the quality of translation. According to Nababan (2012), there are three aspects of TQA: accuracy, acceptability and readability. This research focuses on the accuracy assessment since accuracy deals with the preservation of the message. Both translation and accuracy deal with transferring and preservation of message. Thus, accuracy stands at the top among the three aspects in translation quality assessment.

The film entitled *The Legend of Korra Season 4* is chosen as the object of this research by considering that it is popular film series. This film has been translated into several languages such as German, French and Indonesian. This film is also well-awarded as an Outstanding Achievement in Storyboarding in an Animated TV/Broadcast Production (Annie award) based on <http://www.imdb.com/>.

Taking an example from the film as follows:

No	SL	TL	Type of modulation	Accuracy
1	You can't turn your back on these people.	<i>Kau tidak boleh memalingkan diri dari orang-orang ini.</i>	The whole for the part (synecdoque)	Accurate
2	And don't pretend the people put you where you are.	<i>Dan jangan pura-pura menganggap rakyatlah yang memposisikanmu seperti sekarang ini.</i>	Time for Space	Less Accurate

Table 1. Example of analysis

The example number 1 is the whole for the part (synecdoque). It is a type of modulation in which a whole set in source language text refers to the part of a set in target language text. The word **back** is a part of a set body. Then it is translated into *diri* which is a whole set in target language. Example number 1 is accurate where the source language is accurately transferred without any distortion or ambiguity.

The example number 2 is time for space. It is a type of modulation in which expression indicating space in source language is translated into expression indicating time in target language or vice versa. The expression **where you are** indicates space in source language. Then, it is translated into *sekarang ini* which indicates time in target language. Example number 2 is less accurate because there is an ambiguity in translating the word **pretend** into *pura-pura menganggap*. It is very interesting to be the object of the research dealing with modulation procedure and accuracy assessment. Thus, this study aims to find out the types of modulation procedure and describe the translation accuracy of the subtitle of the legend of Korra 4.

LITERARY REVIEW

1. *Translation and Subtitling*

Translation is process of transferring meaning from one language as the SL into another language as the TL. Larson (1984) states that translation is transferring the meaning of SL into the receptor language.

Subtitling deals with the transcription of utterances displayed on screen. According to Bartrina in Cintas and Anderman (2009), subtitling is a way of translating what is being said in an audiovisual text with two characteristic features. First, there is a change of medium from the oral to written form. Second, the oral form is also presented in the translated product. In other words, written form (subtitle) and oral form may occur in a film simultaneously.

There are different types of subtitling. According to Gottlieb in Orero (2004), he characterizes subtitles from linguistic and technical perspective. Linguistically, he divides subtitling into two: intralingual subtitling and interlingual subtitling. Intralingual subtitling deals within the same language. While interlingual subtitling, it deals with production of subtitle in different language. Technically, he divides subtitling into open and close subtitling. Open subtitling goes within the film or it is embedded in the film. While close subtitling, it can be voluntarily added into the film or it is not embedded within the film.

2. *Modulation Procedure*

Newmark (1988) states that modulation is a variation through a change of point of view, of perspective and very often of category of thought.

According to Vinay and Darbelnet (2000), there are ten types of modulation: abstract for concrete, explicative modulation, the part for the whole, one part for another, reversal of terms, negation of opposite, active to passive and vice versa, space for time, exchange of intervals for limits (in space and time) and change of symbol;

- a. Abstract for concrete is a modulation in which the meaning of SL (SL) text is made explicit in TL (TL). It also includes the conversion from general to the particular, collective plural to singular and indefinite to the indefinite article.

- b. Explicative Modulation has several forms in order to give the cause for the effect, means for the result and substance for the object.
- c. The part for the whole is a modulation in which the SL text of a part of a set refers to the whole set in TL or vice versa.
- d. One part for another is a modulation that occurs when referent in SL is referred to as a certain part of it and it is referred to its other part in TL.
- e. Reversal of terms is a modulation where the subject in SL becomes the object in TL or vice versa.
- f. Negation of opposite is a modulation in which there are double negative expressions in SL and it is translated as positive expression in TL or vice versa.
- g. Active to passive and vice versa are used when the active form (or vice versa) of the text in TL sounds awkward or is grammatically incorrect.
- h. Space for time is used when expression or a term indicating space in SL is modulated into a term that indicates time in TL or vice versa.
- i. Exchange of intervals for limits is a type of modulation in which the interval of time limit and limit of space in SL is modified to a commonly used in TL and it also sounds more natural in TL.
- j. Change of symbols occurs when a unit in SL is translated into TL as a unit more commonly used by TL natives.

3. Accuracy Assessment

Translation accuracy means the message of the source text is transferred into target text correctly. Shuttleworth and Cowie (1997) state as follows:

“Accuracy is a term used in translation evaluation to refer to the extent to which a translation matches its original, while it usually refers to preservation of the information content of ST in TT, with an accurate translation being generally literal then free, its actual meaning in the content of a given translation must depend on the type of equivalence.”

The accuracy of the message is an important thing in translation as stated by Baker (1992) that accuracy is no doubt an important aim in translation, but it is also important to bear in mind that the use of common TL patterns which are familiar to the reader plays an important role in keeping the communication channel open.

No	Translation category	Score	Qualitative parameters
1	Accurate	3	Meaning of word, technical term, phrase, clause, sentence or text in SL is transferred accurately without any distortion of meaning.
2	Less accurate	2	Most of the word meaning, technical term, phrase, clause, sentence or text in SL is transferred accurately. However there is a distortion of meaning or ambiguity or the omission of meaning that disrupts the complete message.
3	Inaccurate	1	Meaning of word, technical term, phrase, clause, sentence or text in SL is transferred inaccurately or omitted

Table 2. Parameters of Accuracy Assessment (Nababan et al, 2012)

RESEARCH METHOD

This research belongs to descriptive qualitative research focusing on the analysis of types of modulation procedure and its accuracy. The data are obtained from *the legend of Korra season 4* film and the raters in assessing its accuracy. The data are in form of the English and Indonesian subtitle of *the legend of Korra season 4* containing modulation procedure and questionnaire.

In collecting the data for modulation procedure, I watched the film, transcribed the Indonesian subtitle, downloaded the English subtitle and checked the English subtitle by listening the utterance in the film to assure that the utterance is well transcribed. Then, for the accuracy assessment, questionnaires were distributed to three raters and analyzed it to describe the translation accuracy.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

a. Result

1. Modulation Procedure

No	Types of Modulation Procedure	Total (Data)	Percentage
1	Abstract for Concrete (AFC)	10	12,82%
2	The Part for The Whole (PFW)	6	7,69%
3	One Part For Another (OPFA)	5	6,41%
4	Reversal of Terms (RT)	14	17,94
5	Negation of Opposite (NO)	5	6,41%
6	Active to Passive or Vice Versa (APVV)	29	37,17%
7	Space For Time (SFT)	4	5,12%
8	Exchange of Intervals For Limits (EIFL)	5	6,41%
TOTAL		78	100%

Table 3. Result of Modulation Procedure

2. Accuracy Assessment

Classification	Total (Data)	Percentage
Accurate	49	62,82%
Less Accurate	28	35,89
Inaccurate	1	1,28
TOTAL	78	100%

Table 4. Result of Accuracy Assessment

a. Discussion

4.2.1 Modulation Procedure

a. Abstract for concrete

SL **This** isn't going to be good.

TL ***Firasatku*** *buruk*.

Datum 001/I/AFC shows that there is a word that has abstract meaning in SL and it is translated into a concrete word that has more specific meaning. **This** can mean *keadaan*, *situasi* or *firasat*. In TL, **this** is translated into ***firasatku*** which is more specific.

b. The Part for The Whole

SL And together they plotted behind **my back**

TL *Dan bersama mereka merencanakannya diam-diam di belakangku.*

Datum 012/V/PFW above shows that a phrase in SL refers to a part of a set, while in TL its translation refers to the whole set. In SL, **my back** is only a part of body, while in TL **ku** is a whole set that refers to someone.

c. One Part For Another

SL **Look**, I was tasked with bringing stability to the Earth Kingdom.

TL ***Dengar**, aku mendapat tugas untuk membawa keseimbangan bagi kerajaan bumi.*

Datum 020/V/OPFA shows that there is a change of sensory use which indicates change of referent. In SL, **Look** indicates sensory use of sight. Sensory of sight refers to part of body which is eyes. However, in TL, **look** is translated into **dengar** which indicates sensory use of hearing. Sensory of hearing refers to part of body which is ear.

d. Reversal of Terms

SL I know you want to help, but trust me, everyone has **this** under control.

TL *Aku tahu kau ingin membantu, tapi percayalah, **semua** sudah terkendali.*

Datum 023/II/RT shows that there is a change of object in SL that becomes subject in TL. In SL, **this** stands as object. Then, it is translated into **semua** in which it stands as subject.

e. Negation of Opposite

SL Who **can forget** Amon and his Equalist revolution?

TL *Siapa yang **tak ingat** dengan Amon dan revolusi Equalist-nya?*

Datum 037/VIII/NO shows that there is a negation of opposite. In SL, there is a positive expression (positive modal verb) **can** which is

followed by adversative word **forget**. Then, in SL, it is translated into **tak ingat** in which the word **tak** is negative expression and **ingat** is the antonym of **forget** (*lupa* in Indonesian).

f. Active to Passive

SL I won't celebrate until the Earth Kingdom **is** 100% **reunited**.

TL *Aku tidak akan merayakannya sebelum kerajaan bumi 100% **bersatu** kembali.*

Datum 043/I/APVV shows that there is a change of form from passive to active form. In SL, there is to be that followed by past participle (**is reunited**). Then, it is translated into **bersatu** in which it is active form. In TL, there is no prefix *di-* or *ter-* which indicates passive form.

g. Space For Time

SL I didn't come all this way to stop **now**.

TL *Aku datang bukan untuk berhenti **di sini**.*

Datum 072/X/SFT shows that there is a term indicating time in SL. Then, it is translated into a term that indicates space in TL. The word **now** in SL indicates time. Then, it is translated into **di sini** indicating space in TL.

h. Exchange of Interval For Limits

SL You were tossing me around like a rag doll **all day long**.

TL *Kau mneghajarku ke sana kemari seperti boneka **seharian**.*

Datum 077/III/EIFL above shows that there is a change of interval of time. In SL, **all day long** covers 24 hours in a day. However, in TL, **seharian** only covers 12 hours in a day from 06.00 a.m until 06.00 pm.

4.2.2. Accuracy Assessment

a. Accurate

A translation is accurate if Meaning of word, technical term, phrase, clause, sentence or text in source language is transferred accurately without any distortion of meaning. In this research, I find 49 data

which are accurately transferred from source language into target language. The analysis of accurate data is presented as follows:

Example 1 (datum code 002/I/AFC)

Source Language	it might be time to make a tough call .
Target Language	<i>mungkin sudah saatnya membuat keputusan berat.</i>

Datum 002/I/AFC is accurate translation. All raters give score three (3) for this datum without any comment or suggestion for alternative translation. It shows that all raters agree that translation of datum 002/I/AFC is accurate. In source language, there is noun phrase a tough call in which the bolded noun literally means *panggilan*. Then, it is translated into *keputusan* (decision). Datum 002/I/AFC is uttered where there are a boy, a girl and governor seeing citizens in hunger. Then, the boy asks governor to surrender the city to their enemies expecting they will get help as proposed by their enemies. Thus, *keputusan* is an accurate translation for **call**. In this datum, there is no distortion at all. The meaning of source language is accurately transferred.

b. Less accurate

A translation is less accurate if Most of the word meaning, technical term, phrase, clause, sentence or text in source language is transferred accurately. However, there is a distortion of meaning or ambiguity or the omission of meaning that disrupts the complete message. In this research, I find 28 data are less accurate. The analysis of less accurate data is presented as follows:

Example 1 (Datum Code 001/I/AFC)

Source Language	This isn't going to be good.
Target Language	<i>Firasatku buruk.</i>

Datum 001/I/AFC is less accurate. R1 and R2 give score two (2) and R3 gives score three (3). The mean score for this datum is 2,3 showing

that it belongs to less accurate translation. **This** in source language is translated into *firasatku* in target language. I believe that based on context, **this** in source language does not represent or express opinion. Datum 001/I/AFC is uttered where there are a boy and a girl seeing their enemies getting closer and moving down from a train. It means that the boy and girl see the situation or condition exactly. Thus, it is not accurate if **this** is translated into *firasatku* because *firasat* only represents opinion without seeing the condition or situation directly. In addition, R1 gives comment as follows:

R1 “condition”, *firasat* stands in mind without knowing (seeing)

It is clear enough that *firasat* only represents or expresses opinion without knowing or seeing. While **condition** (*kondisi*), it represents someone’s idea expressing situation after knowing or seeing directly to the situation. Thus, the translation will be more accurate if *firasat* is replaced by *kondisi*.

c. Inaccurate

A translation is inaccurate if meaning of word, technical term, phrase, clause, sentence or text in source language is transferred inaccurately or omitted.

Source Language	Great, this is just what we need. I got this.
Targte Language	<i>Bagus! Inilah yang kita butuhkan. Serahkan padaku.</i>

Datum 033/XI/RT is inaccurately transferred. R1 and R2 give score one (1), but R3 gives score two (2). The mean score of this datum is 1,3 showing that it belongs to inaccurate translation. It is because meaning of source language is inaccurately transferred or totally different with meaning in target language. The context of this utterance is that a prince, a chief and an assistant were going to inform emergency news for citizens through radio broadcasting. The assistant did first, but

most of citizens were panic and called the radio broadcasting company. Then, the prince took chance after the assistant informing the citizens in his own words. In source language, **I got this** is an expression of delivering statement that the speaker (the prince) did informing the citizens. However, in target language, **serahkan padaku** is an expression of asking something. It is totally different. In addition, R1 and R3 give comment as follows:

R1 In SL, it is statement that I am who did the thing, but in TL, he is asking something.

R3 *Bagus. Inilah yang kita butuhkan. Berikan padaku.*

R1 states that in source language, the utterance is a statement in which the speaker states that he did something. However, in target language, it is an expression of requesting something in which the speaker requests to have chance to give information for citizens. Thus, it is totally different and inaccurate. While R3, he gives alternative translation to be **Bagus. Inilah yang kita butuhkan. Berikan padaku.** I do not believe that the alternative translation suggested by R3 is accurate because it is almost the same with the previous translation in target language. There is still an expression of requesting something not stating something. In alternative translation suggested by R3, there is expression of requesting something. **Berikan padaku** indicates expression of requesting something. Thus, it is classified as inaccurate.

The most dominant type of translation procedure is active to passive or vice versa. It happens because of the different rules between Indonesian and English; 1) English has a term of *to+infinitive* while Indonesian doesnot have it, 2) Indonesian has two prefixes to make sentence to be passiveby adding *di-* and *ter-*.

Based on the accuracy assessment of the subtitle of the legend of Korra season 4, most of the data are translated accurately. However, there are still data which are less accurately or even inaccurately translated since this film belongs to animation, action and adventure film which needs strong explanation on each situation, but it is limited by time and space in subtitling.

5. Conclusion and Recommendation

5.1. Conclusion

There are 78 data classified into eight types of modulation procedure found in the subtitle of *the legend of Korra season 4* and the most dominant one is active to passive or vice versa covering 29 data (37,17%). Out of 78 data, 49 data (62,82%) are belong to accurate translation and it is generally concluded that most of the subtitle of *the legend of Korra season 4* is accurate.

5.2. Recommendation

It is expected that translators are motivated to produce a high quality translation and reduce mistakes in translating a text and to be aware in choosing words to preserve meaning. I suggest the other researchers to conduct research on transposition procedure which is closely related to modulation procedure.

REFERENCES

- Baker, M. (1992). *In Other Words: A Course Book on Translation*. Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press
- Cintas, D and Anderman, G. (2009). *Audiovisual Translation Language Transfer on Screen*. United Kingdom: Palgrave Macmillan
- Imdb. *The Legend of Korra Award*. Retrieved May 29, 2016 from <http://www.imdb.com/title/tt1695360/awards>
- Larson, M. (1984). *Meaning-Based Translation: A guide to cross language equivalence*. Boston: University Press of America.
- Lever, H.J. (1989) *.MA in Translation & Interpreting*. Retrieved May 29, 2016, from (<http://www.peak-translations.co.uk/pdfs/Subtitling.pdf>)
- Nababan, et al. (2012). *Pengembangan Model Penilaian Kualitas Terjemahan*. Surakarta: Sebelas Maret University Press.
- Newmark, P. (1988). *A Textbook of Translation*, Shanghai: Shanghai Foreign Language Educational Press.

Orero, P. (2004). *Topics in Audiovisual Translation*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company.

Shuttleworth and Cowie. (1997). *Dictionary of Translation Studies*. New York: St Jerome Publishing